

Insights into Salzman's metaphors

Fields of categories + sub-categories and comment/metaphor examples

- **Senses:**
 - **Sound** - musical instruments (orchestra, choir, wind instruments, harp, drum, bells), tone (resonating, echo, ringing), voices (top voice, bass), pedalling, loud/quiet).
 - **Sight** - light/darkness, colours & shades, transparency, shine/brilliance, shapes.
 - **Touch** - soft/stiff, sharp/blunt, smooth/rough, wet/dry, to bang/caress/strum.
 - **Taste** – sweet/dolce, peppery, bitter, piquant, spices.
 - **Smell** – fragrance, "a garden of roses", perfume.
- **Bodily experience**
 - **Sensation** – breath, tension, energy, healthy/sick, hot/cold, body parts.
 - **Weight** – light/leggiro, heavy, with weight, weight and release.
 - **Movement** – to walk / run / fly / crawl / rest, fluent, continuous, start/end.
- **Image-schemas** (experience-based perception and assessment of our world)
 - **Movement variables** – direction (forward, back, up, down), distance (far), speed & time.
 - **Quantifiers** – intensity (intense, more, less, moderate), measure (accurate, equal, a lot, a little), capacity (full, empty), size (big, small, long, short, grand, giant), value (important, unimportant).
- **External qualities/features**
 - **Appearance & Arrangement** – clarity, clean, beautiful, nurtured, prominent, consistent, organised connected/disconnected, accentuated/not, not "every note"/all of the notes.
 - **Style** – elegant, majestic, classical, refined, rich, grandiose, not pompous.
- **Internal/spiritual qualities/features:**
 - **Atmosphere** – mysterious, hypnotic, dreamy, daydream, magical, religious, holy, romantic, nostalgic, a memory, in the past, present/now, festive, not mundane.
 - **Emotion** – happy/joyous, sad/depressed/distressed, disappointed, with regret, angry, agitated, anxious, excited, with hope, worried, calm, passionate, proud, longing, in love.
 - **Character** – simple, special, different, noble, poor, nice/not nice, human, demonic.
 - **Behaviour** – playful, mischievous, hesitant/determined, violent/not aggressive, not shy, introverted, insecure/with confidence, impatient, insistent, restrained, rebelling.
- **Images** (actions, creations, elements and objects in our world):
 - **Action** – to build, to prepare, to develop, to play, to paint, to lead, to search.
 - **Speech (& Literature)** – to speak, to sing, to argue, to beg, to complain, to deliberate, question/answer, request, statement, to cry/shout, to whisper, to laugh, diction. (Literature: *Faust*, *Mickiewicz' Ballad*, *Comedia del arte*, *Rashi Interpretation*.)
 - **Music (& Dance)** – melodic, harmonic, rhythmic, genres, composers, performers.
 - **Nature** - fire, storm, wind, water (drop, wave, stream, fall), sun, animals, seasons.
 - **Other** – on earth, in sky/heaven, in space, "church", open/closed, electricity, mechanical, pearly, muslin, boots, wooden shoes, Jewish, Spanish, Gypsy, German, mermaid, elves, demons, ghosts, a ballerina, a prince on a horse, marionettes, sticking out her tongue, not to lie in a hammock and smoke pot.
- **Complex metaphors:** "a stroll through a garden of roses", "droplets of light", "not to declare, to melt with pleasure [להתמוגג]", heat wave, great laziness, sailing in a boat, only the water moves it, more spoiled and lazy", "ready, steady, go!", "the silences speak here", "time stands still".

Popular repeating comments (the number of mentions appears in square brackets)

[The main metaphors were coloured according to the colour-scheme of the main categories]

The following repeating comments disclose the main musical features in Salzman's musical approach, revealing her focus, from the immediate and initial levels to the fine tuning of artistry. Some terms simply refer to basic elements of music without defining how they should be executed, and yet, in our work, they developed into a clear and concise code of very specific meanings which were apparent to all of Salzman's pupils and easily and quickly adopted by newcomers as well. Where possible, I have added examples of metaphor combinations which clarify Salzman's vision of these terms in specific locations, connecting domains and demonstrating the desirable execution.

- **"tone" / "with tone"** [285] – Despite the fact that this highly significant comment obviously belongs to the sound domain, it may seem pointless to anyone who does not realise its meaning, as all music consists of tones. Nevertheless, when writing it in our scores, Salzman aimed at a specific sound-tone image, not only in the intensity of its sonority or its aesthetic beauty, but also in its speaking/singing quality, the depth of its touch and its expression (all of which were repeating comments, which often went hand in hand with 'tone'). Salzman considered the intention and will of the performer, even from the level of the touch of the finger itself, vital to the production of the desired tone, as she expressed in one interview: "It is essential to know how to make sound. Besides, it is essential that the fingers love the keys [of the piano]." ¹ This saying was well known to Salzman's pupils; personally, I remember she also added: "and cling to them" – as she stressed the intensity and focus at the tip of her fingers. Salzman's expressive speaking tone was a uniquely beautiful feature of her playing, one that has also famously characterised Cortot. Indeed, it was also the goal of many students (her own, and others) who tried to imitate it unsuccessfully. I vividly remember one pianist who played the second movement of Ravel's piano concerto for Salzman in a masterclass actually asking her how she produces this tone, watching closely to try and grasp the movement of Salzman's fingers as they touched the keyboard (which was quite amusing). However, the main ingredient in Salzman's sound-making was not to be observed visually but to be felt, as she also marked on scores at times (albeit merely in special places): "to want". Although this seems to lack specificity, for Salzman, the secret for achieving a convincing performance always remained hidden in the performer's spirit. Pairings with the term include:
 - **"singing tone"** [repeating comment documented in the Sound sub-category]
 - **"tone", "expression"** [Haydn]
- **"rhythmic" / "rhythm"** [216] – Comments on rhythm were common particularly when referring to rhythmic character, usually connected to higher precision and accuracy – not only in time, but also in the clarity of the notes and the tone (less pedal, lighter and pinpointed touch, as opposed to deep or clinging), and in the energy and alertness of the fingers and the proposed character/emotion of the music. In many cases it was mentioned in contrast with more melodic/expressive sections, and in others, to restrain over-emotional and lingering exaggerations, since, as Salzman herself put it, it was necessary to play the music with integrity and "class".
Examples of its use in the context of other comments include:
 - **"rhythmic, steady and accurate"** [Mozart]
 - **"rhythmic"; "more rhythmic and joyful and not singing!"** [Mozart]
 - **"marionettes", "angular", "rhythmic"** [Schumann]
 - **"brilliant not stiff", "rhythmic", "accurate"** [Debussy]
 - **"biting, keep the rhythm"** [Rachmaninoff]

¹ Pnina Salzman, Tel-Hai interview, 2006.

- *“to sing” / “singing” / “cantabile”* [143] – Singing at the piano was an ideal for Salzman; a musical descendent and admirer of Chopin, one of the most melodic composers who viewed the *Bel canto* as a model for pianistic declamation and fullness of tone², this is not surprising. “Singing” comments were repeated in a variety of additional definitions such as “lyrical” [44], “melodic” [21], and “poetic” [20], creating a large number of incidences. Pairings with the terms include:
 - *“singing”, “with emotion”; “change the time”; “l. h. more legato”* [Beethoven]
 - *“singing”, “with all the heart”, “with emotion”; “to play with more heart”; “melodic. not chords”* [Tchaikovsky]
- *“clear”* [126] – Salzman was very concerned with clarity and accuracy, particularly in relation to achieving a stylistically appropriate performance as well as precise and persuasive expression and character. Clarity was required not only in the rhythm, the pedal or the diction of the notes (comparable with actors or singers, who, without proper pronunciation, will not be understood), but also in defining and focusing on the right balance of texture, tone, character and emotion. Examples of its use in the context of other comments include:
 - *“rhythmic”, “clear”* [Mozart, Chopin, Ravel]; *“accurate”, “clear”* [Debussy]
 - *“a clarinet, don’t sing it, it should be clear”, “bright”* [Beethoven]
 - *“clear”, “diction”; “declaration”, “clear”* [Chopin]
 - *“clear and bell-like”, “clear and brilliant”* [Rachmaninoff]
- *“[with] emotion”* [102]; closely followed by – *“[with] character”* [100] are two distinct pillars of Salzman’s musical approach. The fact that neither definition specified the intended emotion/character was not a problem as it was usually easily recognisable. In general, “emotion” meant to devote oneself even more to the note or the phrase on which it was written. This devotion was physically expressed by the depth of touch, and the intensity of expressive intention, concentrating at the tip of the fingers; “character” was usually directed at achieving a more determined nature, which often required a decisive and instant change of consciousness and focus, related to the execution of clearer tone, diction and rhythm, and an overall “spine”. Examples of its use in the context of other comments include:
 - *“more character and direction”, “more rhythmic, “no left pedal”* [Tchaikovsky]
 - *“more emotion”, “to fly”; “more tone and less accompaniment”* [Tchaikovsky]
- *“more”* [99] – This simple yet meaningful term had many iterations, although I mostly avoided counting it when it joined other terms and only indicated it for aspects of intensity. For Salzman, understanding the rise and fall in our experience as well as in notes, phrases and whole sections in the piece in accordance with its character and its transformations, was at the very heart of creating sensation, movement and life. Specifically, “more” was also a code word for reaching higher, demanding more of ourselves, expressing more, which evidently translated to more focused execution.
- *“to speak” / “speaking” / “speech” / “spoken” / “parlando”* [78] – This metaphor was another central term, next to the “singing” terms, and may also be joined by other speech definitions such as: asking, answering, arguing, deliberating, begging, declaring, and so on. Again, all of the above encouraged more emotional/characteristic accuracy. If singing was a prominent feature, speaking was just as important to Salzman, who many times asked us to express phrases by speaking, rather than singing them. In a way, I believe it was more expressive for her (especially in relation to the more sorrowful emotions) when one speaks from the heart rather than when one sings. Remembering her admired mentor Alfred Cortot, she told me: “He did not play, he *spoke* on the piano.” Examples of “speech” in the context of other comments include:

² Jean-Jacques Eigeldinger, *Chopin: Pianist and Teacher*, trans. Naomi Shohet (Cambridge University Press, 1986), 44.

- “*telling* [a story]”; “*to speak (and not only to sing)*”, “*not every note*”, “*not everything the same*”, “*more afraid and unsure*” [Mozart]
 - “*more tone*”, “*speaking*”, “*with emotion*”; “*tone*”, “*alas* [שוד ושבר]” [Chopin]
 - “In Chopin, I envision a *lyrical* piece *full of love*, and it speaks. *It is passionate but it does not sing—it speaks, it’s parlando.*” [Schumann]
 - “*full tone*”, “*deeper*”, “*to speak*” [Gershwin]
- “*musical*” [75] – Another seemingly unexceptional comment (by definition all music is “musical”!) that had a specific use. Playing musically implied ‘good taste’ along with a smooth flow of dynamics and time according to the rise and descent of the phrase, which were often expressed by images of sight depicting the musical line:
- “*to paint* and play *musical*” [Mozart]
 - “*musical*”; “*melodic*”, “more *polite*”; “*without accents*” [Mozart]
 - “*to tell a story*”; “*musical*”, “*not stormy*”, “*elegant*” [Chopin]
 - “everything more *graceful*”; “*musical* and *with grace*” [Liszt]
 - “*melodic*”; “*upper voice*”; “*not stiff*”, “*beautiful tone*”, “*musical*” [Liszt]
 - “*legato* and in a *musical line*” [Rachmaninoff]
- “*upper voice/tone*” [75] – An important and vivid comment for all of Salzman’s pupils. Salzman regular focus on bringing out the upper voice was one of the highlights in creating a beautiful sound-image, balanced with a much softer nonabrasive accompaniment for the most part. Salzman concentrated the expression and the tone in the tip of the 5th finger in octaves and chords as well, with constant melodic thinking. Examples of its use in the context of other comments include:
- “*upper voice*”; “*melodic*”; “*the tone not stiff*” [Chopin]
 - “*upper voice*”, “*legato*”; “*esp.*”; “*dreamy*” [Chopin]
 - “*sing* the r. h.”, “*upper voice*”, “*legato*” [Chopin]
 - “*accentuate the soprano*”; “*on earth (church)*”; “*melodic-legato-not chords*”, “*hear harmonies and basses*”, “*hear the l. h.*” *Notice the different terminology used by Salzman: ‘to accentuate’ the upper voice and ‘hear’ the others. [Chopin]
- *pedal*” [73]; “*less/clean pedal*” [56]; “*without pedal*” [51]; “*U. C.*” [45] – The pedal was regularly employed in creating the full tone Salzman was seeking. I remember her telling me once, at the beginning of a certain piece, that pressing the pedal is equivalent to pressing the clutch in a car. Many times, you need to do it just to get going! However, as the complementary comments show, one needed to know how to release the pedal as well and use both pedals creatively in order to support the required tone and character. As for the left pedal, U. C., Salzman used it quite sparingly, only when she wanted to create a certain special sound-image, and she refrained from touching it otherwise as she felt it detracted from the beauty of the “tone” she required. Personally, I probably used it too often (especially when I was insecure in my ability to reach low dynamics in gentle phrases), to which she responded by threatening to tie my left leg to the chair!
- Examples of its use in the context of other comments:
- “What about the pedal? We need to *arrange the pedal* now; it cannot be a pedal on two bars like this. [...] If you can - because *if you take off the pedal, everyone can hear what you’re doing*. That is what’s dangerous in Mozart, because it is all *transparent*. So if you feel well and you worked and have a clear conscious than take off the pedal, if not - leave all of the pedal, this is my best advice.” [Mozart]
 - “*Don’t lift the pedal on the silence* – it is *dry*. In Debussy *the silences are made out of water, they are wet.*” [Debussy]
 - “*to pour* [להשתפך]”, “*with pedal*” [Rachmaninoff] (Water images = pedal)
 - “*sing with a closed mouth*”, “*U. C.*” [Mussorgsky]

- “*soft*” [72]; “*legato*” [72]; “*not [too] dry*” [60]; “*not stiff*” [40]; “*deep*” / “*deeper*” [40] – This string of popular touch metaphors is also closely related to emotion/sensation, and, of course, sound. It indicates the touch necessary to accurately create Salzman’s image of “Tone” (Salzman’s most common comment), as well as the actual tone itself, which was singing and expressive. Many of these words relate to more than one domain: the words “soft” and “deep” also refer to Emotion/Expression (I was inclined to translate the word “soft” as “tender” at times but eventually decided against it, as another Hebrew word Salzman also used was more closely related). As in all matters of touch & movement (of the hand), expression, and eventually tone – these aspects are tightly linked to one another. According to Salzman, the right movement and touch will create the matching expression and touch and vice versa. I shall elaborate on these matters in the Touch & Movement chapter.
- “[with] *expression*” [63] – This comment shares similarities with the previous general inner qualities comments: “[with] emotion” and “[with] character”, although it also relates to speech and the communication of the emotion.
- “*beautiful*” / “*beauty*” [61] – Referring to tone, melody, or phrasing, playing beautifully usually implied round and smooth tone and phrasing, without accents or exaggerations and a bright and light expression. Examples of its use in the context of other comments:
 - “*not pompous*”, “*calm tone*”, “bring out the theme *beautifully and quietly*”, “*without accents on the first beats*”, “*without dynamic exaggerations*” [Bach]
 - “*laughter- beautiful and not too sweet*” [Haydn]
 - “*light [Weight]*”, “*beautiful*”, “*with grace*” [Haydn]
 - “*no tension, now really beautiful*” [Beethoven]
 - “*not to be insolent*”, “*refined and beautiful*”, “*to bow*”, “*classical*”; “*appeased*” [Beethoven]
- “*to ask*”; “*asking*”; “*question*”; **question mark* [51] – Over fifty varieties of speech were documented in the database; to ask a question was one of the more specific and common types. Salzman discussed this matter in one of her interviews with Meir: “Usually I hear many ‘answers’ in concert halls, but I very rarely hear questions. [...] It’s usually very assertive, and there are so many questions in music and in phrases, but lately I don’t hear questions.” Her words imply more than Speech, but also a state of consciousness, of humility, of openness and wonder, which teaches us, as with so many of her musical thoughts, and music in general, about life itself (and vice versa).
- “*breath/s*” / “*to breathe*” (40) – Treating the music as a living, breathing being was a key element in Salzman’s phrasing and sound-production. Hand breathing through an upward release motion of the wrist was essential before the beginning of each sentence and in between phrases and verses, to achieve a beautiful tone and convincing speech. Silences were often referred to as breaths as well, and in these cases, it was important to always breathe before the next note (rather than after the last). Breaths also contributed to the mood and atmosphere, creating an unmistakable sensation, as they are such an inseparable intrinsic part of our existence. The verbal indications are only a fraction of the infinite breath signs Salzman marked in our scores, mostly in order to clarify the phrasing. When verbally written, breaths were usually significant to the character/atmosphere. Examples of its use in the context of other comments include:
 - “*with direction*”, “*mysterious*”; “*breaths*”, “*without accents*” [Haydn]
 - “*Aveu is confession, a declaration of love which is written appassionato, but the unique thing is that the appassionato should really be expressed through the rests and not the notes. There is a certain restlessness of character if this piece, expressed by the silences, which are very worried and not peaceful. On the rests, I actually take quick breaths to emphasize its restlessness.*” [Schumann]

Complex metaphors

In the summarising Categories/Composers table I have included a section on Complex Metaphors which comprise combinations of metaphors from different domains on the same material that enhance, explain or elaborate each other's meaning in Salzman's own words; comments that sharpened subtle nuances of her vision; examples of embodied connections she sought; and elaborated ideas/images.

These cross-domain metaphorical mappings are helpful in the translation of Salzman's language and in the implementation of her intentions through execution. I have added explanations to some metaphors, and documented others without any additions – only to provide a sense of their accumulated meanings.

▪ **Combinations of comments/metaphors from different domains on the same material:**

[Metaphors/comments were coloured according to the colour-scheme of the main categories]

- “the entire prelude *in one plane*”, “*calm*”, “*modest* but *singing*”, “*not accentuated*”, “*lean/thin tone*”, “*not fat*”, “*U. C., too much pedal*” [Bach – Partita no. 1 / Prelude] – This combination of images clarifies Salzman's vision for the sound-image, character and execution of this prelude, as the complementing metaphors and instructions translate one another: *In one plane / calm* = *no accents* (and no marked dynamic changes) ; *modest* = *lean/thin tone* = *U. C., not fat*, [not] *too much pedal* (and '*calm*' dynamics).
- “more *internal* and *sad*”, “*not too fast* and *without too much forward motion*” [Haydn] – Linking movement/speed with emotion.
- “*with substance*”; “*sing every note*” [Haydn] – Value through attention & enunciation.
- “*flowing naturally* in one *continuous line*” [Haydn] – The term '*flowing*', a recurring comment, depicts natural movement; '*naturally*' is characterised through continuity.
- “*with direction*”, “*mysterious*”; “*breaths*”, “*without accents*” [Haydn] – The mysterious atmosphere is characterised an uninterrupted horizontal sound-image (no accents) combined with a heightened awareness to sensation (breaths).
- “*with tension*”, “*to build*”, “*in movement*”, “*not still*” [Haydn]
- “*more rhythmic*”, “*with life* and *humour*”, “*like a street child*” [Mozart]
- “*excited*”; “*to ask*”, “*not 'to sing' every note* (larger groups)” [Mozart]
- “*quiet*”, “*not jumping*”; “*not too staccato*”, “*not dry* or *empty*”, “*singing*”, “*one long phrase*”, “*direction*” [Mozart]
- “*playful, musical*”, “*children's choir*”; “*not stiff*”, “*rhythmic*”, “*lively*”; “*not too staccato*”, “*play in whole bars and not half bars*” [Mozart]
- “*fearful*”, “*excited/anxious*”, “*breathless*”, “*more breaths* (the pedal!)”, “*l. h. legato*”, “*don't stop*”; “*sensitive*” [Mozart]
- “*sing* the music *in your heart*”, “*with direction*”; “*less heavy*”, “*light* [Weight] (and only the *important* notes” [- the changing sopranos]), “*everything with flow* [זרימה] and *direction*”; “*l. h. fluent*” [שוטף] [Mozart]
- “the entire *atmosphere* is of *innocence*”, “*without heaviness*”, “*a child*”, “and *with longing* and *kindness*”, “there is *no real pp* in the entire movement” [Mozart]
- “*time stands still*”; “in this whole page let *time stand still* - *not to make cresc.* and *movement* and such” [Beethoven]

- “The entire movement should be played *fast*, with *waves* achieved through *crescendi and diminuendi*, creating a *dramatic wind* and a very *stormy mood*.” [Beethoven]
- “The second movement is at *night*. Let there be *darkness*. That's it.”; “*not to move*”, “be *concentrated*”, “it needs to be *empty*”, “play *precisely*”, “most important are the *silences*”, “the *silences speak* here”; “*without vibrato*” [Beethoven]
- “*flowing*”, “*lively tone*”, “*simpler not 'singing'*”; “*June | not too fast | May | flowing*” [Beethoven]
- “*play/game* of *twinkling lights*”
- “The first theme is of *great tragedy, great pain* and it all turns into *desperate screams*. The *agitato* is actually *in the l. h.*”; “*worried*”; “*internal storm*”, “l. h. *piano*”; “*the breaths*”; “*the silences*”, “*articulation fingers*” [Chopin]
- “The second theme is *generous* in its character. Chopin wrote *maestoso*, but in playing I believe it should be played in a *generous* manner and *big*, but *not maestoso*, which represents *strong* and *stiff*. I believe that the *atmosphere* here is *soft* and *not stiff*, as some pianists execute it”; “*full tone*” [Chopin]
- “*satanic staccato*” [Chopin]
- “The funeral march should be played with a feeling of *carrying a great burden on one's shoulders*. The *steps* of the funeral march are in the l. h.; *U. C.* the entire time (except in the ff); “*steps*”, “*continuity*”, “*phrase*”, “*to feel*”; “*upper voice*”, “*more intimate*”, “*less bursting*”, “be careful *not to play 'every crotchet'*” [Chopin]
- “*U. C.*”, “*be careful with the pedal*”; “*softer*”, “*without accents on all the quavers*”; “*Mozart*”, “everything *too loud*”, “*fingernail*”, “*not to faint already*”; “*gentle*”, “*intimate*”, “*kind*”, “*not sweet*”, “*frozen*”, “*not singing in a full/loud tone*”, “*distant* - it is *like something far away* but let it feel as if it is *continuing something that was there before* and *not the beginning*” [Chopin]
- “*the mermaid appears, starts seducing* ... [when the pupil played too heavily with weight on the second note of each pair:] *you can't seduce this way, it grounds* [מבסס] it, [*demonstrates upward motion on the second note], *play/game* [playful] *with grace*”; “*with grace*”, “*breaths*”, “**dim. between each couple of descending notes*”; “*not heavy*”, “*watch the pedal*” [Chopin]
- “*droplets of light*”, “*snowflakes*” [Chopin] – Touch & Weight, Sound, Sight (light, shape).
- “*gentle*”, “*a bit melancholic dance*”, “[the quavers:] *legato but not to sing each one*”, “**without accents*” [Chopin]
- “let it *shimmer* in the hall, let it *be heard*” [Chopin]
- “*with splendour* [הוד]; “*holiness*”, “[r. h.] *light* [Sight]”, “*warmth*”, “[l. h.] *bells from the distance*” [Liszt]
- “*sarcastic*”; “*demonic laughter*”, “*not 'a good boy'*”, “*rhythmic*”, “*hear all the notes*”, “*glissando-like*” [Liszt]
- “play *with fire!* *passion*, and *heart*. and *not routine* [שגרתית]” [Brahms]
- “*Barcarole*”, “more *magical*”, “with *inspiration*”, “*poetic/poetry*”, “*not secular*”; “**cresc.+*dim.* according to the ascents + descents of the melodic line [Brahms]

- “*demonic*”, “*more character* and *direction*”, “*more rhythmic* and *more character*”, “*no left pedal*”; “*short*” [Tchaikovsky]
- “*not technical! suffering*”, “*desperate*” [Tchaikovsky]
- “*a sweet fragrance*”, “*a memory of a dream*”, “*musical*”, “*not enough* melody”, “*less accompaniment*”, [r. h.:] “*brilliant tone*” [Tchaikovsky]
- “*a peasant dance*”, “*boots*”, “*stomping* [on the syncopated notes]”, “*confident*”, “*not agitated*”; “*more character* and *tension*”, “*rhythmic*”; “*not dry*” [Tchaikovsky]
- “*continuous melody and accompaniment*”, “*wide*”, “*legato*”, “*very quiet* accompaniment”, “*basses*” [Faure]
- “*non energetic*”, “*without accents* in the melody and the accompaniment”, “*smooth flow (water)*” [Faure]
- “*dreamy, misty* (in short: *knocked-out* [מְעוּלֵף])” [Faure]
- “*quiet water - quiet, don't move, organise, without rubato*” [Debussy]
- “*dreamy*”, “*not stiff*” [Rachmaninoff]
- “a lot of *force* and *expression*, play *in movement* and not in *an equal division*” [Rachmaninoff]
- “*restrained*”, “a *sharp staccato* from *up close*” [Rachmaninoff]
- “*quietly*”, “*without dynamics*”, “*one line without accents*” [Rachmaninoff]

▪ **Embodiment of the music/images:**

- “*to sing at heart*” [Bach]; “*with light [Sight] at heart*” [Mozart]
- “*strangled with sorrow*” [Mozart]
- “*bursting joy*” [Mozart]
- “*basses from the stomach, from within*” [Beethoven]
- “play with confidence and *enter the music immediately*” [Beethoven]
- “*feel the music* in the entire movement” [Beethoven]
- “play with an *inner light*” [Beethoven]
- “*sharp fingers*” [Chopin]
- “*fight the waves*” [Chopin]
- “*feel the storm in your heart as well*” [Chopin]
- “*brilliant fingers*” [Chopin]

▪ **Specific nuances/subtleties of image, expression & execution:**

- “I always play Scarlatti with *half staccato tone, as each note stands by itself*. I must admit that it is very difficult to play like that, but I believe that in playing his music we must *imagine we are not making the sound of the contemporary instrument*. The sound of today’s piano does not fit this music, in my opinion; there should be more separation between the notes. If the sonata is slow and lyrical – *it needs to sing, not with the sound but in between the notes.*”
[Scarlatti]
- “*a story not sad in itself, but rather told by a sad storyteller*”
[Scarlatti – Sonata K. 9]
- “starts *with expression, but a little distant*”
[Haydn – Variations in F minor]
- “**Be aware of the key, the modulations, the intervals** [...] E flat is *with hope*, C minor is *a bit poor* [...] A flat is *joyous...*”; “[bottom of the last page:] *more shades in the entire movement*”, “*don't [not to] play all the time like a wet mouse and don't [not to] be afraid of the evil cat.*” ;
[Mozart – Concerto no. 21: 2]
- “The 2nd movement is *the night* and contains **wonderful different colouristic nuances** for the piano, such as *piano espressivo, piano cantabile, and piano dolce.*”
[Beethoven – Sonata no. 21: 2]
- “The second movement is written *presto and forte*. I did not understand the character of this *quick movement* with these *extensive passages*. [...] **I did not understand whether it should be light or heavy (presto/forte)**. Then, one of the audience members told me that perhaps I should think that this is *Mozart*, and it will be easier for me. So he really helped me. Since then, I played it *very loud, but with the left pedal*, and at last I thought it was good.”
[Beethoven – Sonata no. 24: 2]
- “**38°** & “**39°**” – This extremely subtle distinction between body temperatures was Salzman’s unique way of ascribing a specific sensation to the relevant sections, while keeping a clear perception of the entire movement and its construction in mind. Though there are some similarities between both sections (ascending arpeggi built on the same organ point throughout their harmonic changes), the first section is to be played with a slight fever (but still functioning and agitated with a forward motion, which is apparent in the ascending melodic direction of the arpeggi complemented by Beethoven’s own *cresc.*), while the second is more feverish, transforming into a sort of hallucination (complemented by Salzman’s comments “*static*” and “*time stands still*”). According to one pupil, this comment was repeated in other pieces as well (Brahms’ 1st piano Concerto, if memory serves me right), and also considered the student’s nature, as for some students 38° was regarded as a rise in temperature, while for others it actually meant slightly cooling off what was previously played even more heatedly.
[Beethoven – Sonata no. 17: 3 – bs. 159 & 323-334, respectively]
- “The second movement should be played *as if it is in space*. **It is not on earth and not in heaven, it is in space, between land and sky** (Salzman then laughs and says, “in science fiction”). It is a pity that people try to make of it something it is not. It should be played *simply, with peacefulness* and with *resignation*. It is **beyond life and not in life**, it is *pure*. The interpreter should *only give atmosphere.*”
[Beethoven – Sonata no. 32: 2]

- “When you are very young, you give a hundred percent of yourself in each phrase. When you get older, you have many other things in your life, which means that the hundred percent become ten percent, as other things take their place. When I was 17, I played the Recitativo “*crying out loud*”. Now, I believe the character of this movement is of something *without any hope at all, desperate, hopeless and very lonely*. It is as if when you are 17 you have someone to cry for help to, but when you get older there are times when you have no one to turn to, and then ***the music becomes lonely.***”
[Beethoven – Concerto no. 4: 2]
- “In the third sonata, the opening is ***maestoso, but it should not be played aggressively*** because it is ***a question which has a noble character.***”
[Chopin – Sonata no. 3: 1]
- “The second movement’s middle section is many times played as a chorale and rather slowly. It should be played *simply and not very slow*, only trying to create a *unique and peaceful atmosphere*. ***You must not play it, it must be played.*** Cortot used to say that it is like *‘two perfumes that got blended together.’*”
[Chopin – Sonata no. 3: 2]
- “In Chopin, I envision a *lyrical piece full of love, and it speaks. It is passionate but it does not sing—it speaks, it’s parlando. Although it is marked as agitato, I play it appassionato instead.* I do not agree with interpreters who play the left hand so loud and agitated, *because in pieces by Chopin or Schumann the left hand should never be loud.* It is only a colour. *When it is loud it becomes ‘Brahmsian’ style.*”
[Schumann - Carnival]
- “The difference between the seemingly similar openings of the first and the fourth pieces (B-G): First of all, *the harmonies are completely different.* In the first piece, the character is *more happy, innocent and cheerful.* The fourth piece is *not a question*, and although I do make diminuendo between the B-G, here Schumann is *not wondering.* Here there is *intensity*, and ***the character is begging, which is different from asking.***”
[Schumann - Kinderszenen]
- “***hypnotic***”, “*be careful not to fall asleep (or put others to sleep)*”; “Salzman added to the *tranquillo* execution instruction: “*ma non meshaamemo*” [***but not boring*** - half Italian half distorted Hebrew with an *Italian flare!*]”
[Mussorgsky – Pictures at an Exhibition]
- “***lyrical but lean touch***”
[Ravel – Sonatine]
- “***the whole page is not a lamentation but a flamenco dancer***”
[Ravel – Alborada del gracioso]
- “*prominent upper voice, second voice always under, without changes in its weight, upper voice - line + tone, second voice - static in its weight*”
[Rachmaninoff – Concerto No. 3: 1]
- “***staccato with depth***” ; “***rhythmic with meat***”
[Rachmaninoff – Rhapsody on a theme of Paganini]

▪ **Special/elaborated ideas/images:**

[Highlighted comments are provided with my own additional explanations and observations.]

- **“ready, steady, go!”; “first attempt, second attempt, succeeds”** – both images give a clear idea of the character and the execution of the relevant phrases/sections and their development. The first comment holds the growing tension of the two long notes (“ready, steady”), before the bursting of the third, and also provides a playful, child-like atmosphere; The second is indicative of the growing insistence of a repeated attempt and joy the of success.
[Mozart – Concerto no. 21: 3 – bs. 58-60; bs. 95-99]
- “It is customary to think that you need to lead to the orchestral part, but this is wrong. You cannot finish a phrase like that [with a *cresc.*]. It is *impolite*. [...] The phrase is *sad*, right? Here it ended with... *poor thing, it didn't help him that he asked. He asked and asked, and it didn't work out... but all of a sudden to finish with a threat? No.*”
[Mozart – Concerto no. 24: 1 – bs. 117-118]
- “Play *ff*. He finally wrote it in octaves and loud and high [register]. Perhaps we make it *noon* here? *He finished with the dawn here. Done. Now it is daytime already, morning.*”
[Beethoven – Sonata no. 21: 3 – b. 313]
- “*There are soldiers lying and resting on the grass, and a horn playing. It's really a landscape. And then they wake the soldiers up* [the octaves from b. 25]. Not so fast. It is *not light and joyous*. There is *mayhem* – *everyone gets up in a hurry*. A little bit of pedal and not [*light weight*]. It was *nice* the way you played it, but it seemed to me more like *Mozart*, and you said it sounded *too heavy* for you, and I play it *serious and deep, a landscape*, and here [b. 25] – *heavy.*”
[Beethoven – Sonata no. 22: 1]
- “The first movement starts with *a mysterious and fearful atmosphere*. It should sound like *ghosts*, at the beginning, *with a certain emptiness* to it. The trills represent *a person begging for his life*. In the repeating notes I imagine *destiny knocking.*”
[Beethoven – Sonata no. 23: 1 – b. 1]
- **“‘judgement day bell’**” – A single image depicting sound (bell – distinct, resonating), atmosphere (judgement day) emotion (foreboding).
[Beethoven – Sonata no. 31: 3 – b. 7]
- “Chopin’s second sonata starts with an introduction. The opening bars are *telling what happened or will happen, but these definitely are not bringing good news with them.*”
[Chopin – Sonata no. 2: 1 - opening]
- **“The middle section is in a dream, yet it is built upon a question.** It keeps repeating and should always be played this way. [However, its expression changes with each repeat as follows:] The first phrase, after 4 bars of introduction, is *a question*, (*‘no worries yet’, ‘quiet and sweet’, ‘starts’, ‘p’*) [bs. 85-89]; The second phrase is *more worried* (*‘tone’, ‘mp’*) [bs. 93-98]; The third phrase is *explaining the whole thing with more logic*, with *more ‘awakening’ and less dreamy* (*‘tone’, ‘mf’, ‘reciting’, ‘to argue’*) [bs. 99-100].” *Comments in brackets were added from pupils’ scores to the abstract interview description in order to maintain its flow. The possibility to combine more concise comments from the pupils with more discursive interview materials provided a clear demonstration of the way Salzman connected her metaphorical insights and ideas with instructions for execution and brought them to life in sound.
[Chopin – Sonata no. 2: 2]

- “For years I have played the first Ballade *very expressively* and *very warmly*. Now, I think it is someone playing *a story of something that has been*. When I was young, it was in the present, these are the hundred percent you give as a young person. Now I do not play it like that anymore. It is not that the person got older – this is wrong! It is the piece that is getting older. The piece has already passed all that we pass through life, and all the many performances you have given of it. [...] I played it so often, that now when I play it, I play it *in the past* and *sad*. If a student plays it for me in the very young “present-like” way, I must let him or her play it like that, because they have to let it out of their system. You cannot strangle someone. I will correct mannerism, or if the accompaniment is not right, but not the way they feel. [...] The piece is *telling a story, a story that has happened*. In the opening introduction, I imagine these words: *‘Now I am going to tell you what happened.’* At the end of the introduction and the entrance of the theme, I imagine *this is what happened.*”

[Chopin – Ballade no. 1]

- “In the 3rd Ballade I see a dialogue which is also expressed in Cortot’s edition [...]:
Q: *‘Will you love me forever?’* [bs. 1-2]; A: *‘Yes, I will.’* [bs. 3-4]; Q: *‘And you, will you love me forever?’* [bs.5-6]; Together: *‘Forever.’* [bs.7-8]; Then, *jubilation, everyone is happy* [bs. 9-51]. But she wants to test his love and see if he really will be faithful to her. She *disguises herself as a mermaid and appears* after the top A-flat [b. 52]. She starts *seducing* him in a *playful* section in which one has to execute Chopin’s pedals precisely. Otherwise the result is that the correct *breathing* will not be kept [bs. 52-57]. He, of course, *falls for the mermaid*, and *his punishment is to follow her in the sea*, represented by the octave section reflecting *big ocean waves* [bs.157-end].”

[Chopin – Ballade no. 3]

- “[Schumann’s Carnival] is called “*Scènes mignons sur quatre notes*” – nice pieces on four notes. It is called ASCH in German, which is the town where Ernestine von Fricken lived. It does not matter if it is fast or slow; it’s *the character* that matters. Tempo is never too fast or too slow; it must always be convincing. The whole piece is *very playful* and *festive* and should be played with *sincerity* and *flirtation*. It is not one of the profound works of Schumann. When playing the piece, one needs to *treat it as a flirt with a dancing ball and people wearing masks. This cannot be a bombastic piece; after all, they are wearing masks!* The opening, for example, has *joy*, but it’s *not of maestoso character*.

Pierrot is a *very scared* person. He is *crawling by the wall at nighttime* where everything is *very dark*, and he is *very insecure*. While he is *searching his way*, he also gets *very scared*, which one can imagine by the repeating motive E flat-C-B flat.

Valse Noble should be played with *nobility* on one hand and *tenderness* on the other.

In *Eusebius*, Schumann writes *semplice*, and it should be played *simple, calm, quite pure* and *shy*, while the following piece, *Florestan*, is undoubtedly *angry*.

Coquette is a *fanciful lady*, who is being *chased by the young guy*. We can really see her in the rhythmical dotted sections. *At times she gets caught by him*, as we can hear through the unison sections marked by *ff*, but *she keeps running away from the young man’s hands*. *Réplique* still deals with these two, only here *he is begging her*, and *she is laughing at him*.

The *Papillons* are not butterflies as many people think, but actually *Schumann’s enemies* he referred to in his critiques as a writer in his magazine.

The *Lettres dansantes*, just like they are called, are the dancing letters that should *dance like marionettes*. This is *not a waltz* and *should not be played grazioso*.

Chiarina [Clara, Schumann's wife] was 16 years old when Schumann wrote this piece on her name. Obviously, he loved her very much, and in this piece, I hear *a lot of passion*.

In *Chopin*, I see a *lyrical piece full of love* and it *speaks*. It is *passionate* but it *does not sing—it speaks*, it's *parlando*. Although it is marked as *agitato*, I play it *appassionato* instead. I do not agree with interpreters who play the left hand so loud and agitated, because in pieces by *Chopin* or *Schumann* the left hand should never be loud. It is only *a colour*, and when it is strong it is already in '*Brahmsian*' style.

Estrella, I don't particularly like her. He never married her although she was his fiancée. I think Schumann really hated her. There is *a lot of anger* expressed throughout and especially the last four notes, where I see him *kicking her out and slamming the door* [Salzman then plays the last measures of the piece]. I think Schumann loves *Chiarina* and hates *Estrella*. When I play it, I actually '*bang*' it at times because I really *hate* her!

Reconnaissance means to identify. This is *a dance* which in the middle section in B major *the two dancers, who were wearing masks, recognize each other*. The piece is about *true love between these two people, who at first were wearing masks and did not recognize each other*.

Pantolon and Colombine talks about *an old man chasing a younger girl*. It is taken from the *Comedia dell'arte*. At the end of this piece, *the girl disappears, perhaps even sticking her tongue out at the old man* as I can imagine by the last two chords.

Aveu is confession, *a declaration of love* which is written *appassionato*, but the unique thing here is that the *appassionato* should really be expressed through the rests and not the notes. There is a certain *restlessness* of the character of this piece, expressed by the silences, which are *very worried* and *not peaceful*. On the rests, I actually *take quick breaths to emphasize the restlessness* of the piece

In *Promenade* one can hear *the husband of the young lady from far away* (little notes), and in the following *Pause everyone is running away from the party*.

In the last piece, the *March des Davidsbündler contre les Philistins*, *David is fighting against the Philistines*, those who Schumann believed to be the people who did not understand music. For him, these were his enemies, and of course *David wins*." [Schumann - Carnaval]

- "There is certain *longevity* in the beginning of '*Strange people and lands*' and there is *a question* between the two ascending notes B-G. This is definitely a question! In all the performances I have heard, I never heard the question. I usually hear it as a declaration, as it is often played in an assertive manner. You know, usually I hear many "answers" in concert halls, but I very rarely hear questions." [Schumann - Kinderszenen]
- "Liszt always kept beside his bed two books: Dante's *Divine Comedy* and Goethe's *Faust*. His B minor sonata is *the story of Faust*. I believe this piece must be played with the imagination of *Faust*. Each character is represented with a different theme, which fits its personality and mood. Without the image of the story, the piece will not receive its true and great meaning." [Liszt – Sonata in B minor]
 - "*Faust*"; "*Faust is always asking*. His *question* appears throughout the piece with the same motive first seen here. *Faust's* representing motive appears with a wide variety of dynamic markings, or disguises." [bs. 8-13]
 - "*Mephisto, on the other hand, is laughing*", "*diabolic laughter*" [bs. 14-15]
 - "*Dieu*" / "*God*", "*noble*", "*wide*", "[r. h.] *to sing*" [bs. 105-114]

- *“Marguerite”; “Margarita appears”; “Margarete/Gretchen - young (15), blond and naïve, simple and sweet”, “everything sweeter”, “not to nag”, “this is not the sleeping beauty”* – Aside from reprimanding the pupil (me) for playing this a bit naggingly and perhaps stretching it (to the point of boredom), Salzman’s reference to another tale is somewhat revealing, perhaps distinguishing the dark story of Faust, and Gretchen’s role in it, from a lighter, happy-ending folk/children’s tale. Although Gretchen is sweet and naïve, her musical appearance should match the context of the story. [bs. 335-347]
- *“a stroll in the sky”* – Although this image can only be envisioned fictionally and not actually experienced, it is not difficult to imagine its intended sensation and meaning, which were also complemented by Salzman’s execution instructions: *“equal and without rubato”, “not every note”*. The stroll gives an indication of speed/movement and a calm/simple emotion/behaviour (*equal and without rubato*), while the sky gives an air of magic, smoothness of tone and phrase, as it is ethereal and intangible, as well as the continuity and flow of an endless/borderless horizon (*not every note*). [from b. 422]
- *“a stroll through a garden of roses”* – This beautiful metaphor gives the performer an abundance of clear and precise sensations/experiences which lead to clear executional insights in a few short words (three words when in Hebrew, to be exact): from the nature of the speed and the movement of the music (a stroll – the type you would take in a garden of roses); the tone (a garden of roses indicates a fragrance, which, although intangible, suggests that the tone should be very gentle and sensitive as well), the weight (no heaviness), the pedal (similarly, quite airy), the connected touch and feeling (gentle and loving, caressing in the likelihood that this sort of a stroll would be probably taken with a loved one, or at least with the feeling of love), the articulation (not separate), and overall sensation (such a stroll would not take place during a stormy/freezing day, or a dark night, but to the sunny rays of warmth and light). [Tchaikovsky – Concerto no. 1: 2 - opening]
- *“Debussy is a composer of colours. In this piece, the pianist needs to work on producing each colour. You have to decide where the water is – and where are the reflections. I see the right hand as representing the water, while the left hand is the reflection [opening]. Without imagination, it is really boring to play, and the right sound and colouring will not be achieved: There is a place where there is a turbulence, as if a leaf fell into the water [b. 18 – second half]; At the end of the piece, I see the drops of water catching the light of the sun [b. 82]... In each piece of music, you must have an imagination, a realisation of the character and the colours.”* [Debussy – *Reflets dans l’eau*]
- *“not to declare! to ‘melt’ with pleasure [להתמוגג], heat wave, great laziness, sailing in a boat, only the water moves it, more spoiled and lazy”* – Combining images, sensations and emotions, Salzman provides a full experience of the music and a clear image of its embodied translation into execution: through the “melting” and “laziness” of the fingers into the instrument (=very legato and lingering, hardly “lifting a finger”); the pedal (melting, water, heat wave = lots of pedal, similarly merging the tones with one another) the movement (lazy but flowing, as if on its own, “only the water moves it”); and the phrasing/speech/tone of the section (“not to declare! to ‘melt’ with pleasure” = no accents, everything rounder). [Debussy - *L’Isle Joyeuse* – from b. 67]
- *“trying out its wings”* – This vivacious metaphor gives the performer both a sense of the different movement and the emotion/behaviour that goes along with it, indicating its tone and texture (through the initial hesitation before the flight, and the different attempts). [Ravel – the opening of the *Sonatine*]